

Annex A – Evaluation Criteria

CIRCULAR BY DESIGN CHALLENGE

23 SEPTEMBRE 2021



**CIRCULAR
BY DESIGN
CHALLENGE**

Contents

CIRCULAR BY DESIGN CHALLENGE	3
Introduction	3
Evaluation criteria	3
Level of circularity	3
Impact	4
Novelty and innovation level of the idea	4
Value creation	5
Scalability	5
Co-creation	Error! Bookmark not defined.
Project Evolution (Final evaluation only)	5
Contact	5

CIRCULAR BY DESIGN CHALLENGE

Introduction

This document defines evaluation criteria for the Circular Design Challenge. It is intended to help the jury think through the different evaluation categories. The jury will be asked to rate each category on a scale of 1 – 10. The criteria are based on the definitions used in the [Circular Economy Strategy Luxembourg](#) (published in February 2021) and on evaluation criteria used for similar challenges. The development of new circular product ideas and services means rethinking business models whilst focusing (among other things) on design, resources and marketing & communication, to foster an economically viable and feasible solution.

Evaluation criteria

Note: The jury will take into account the maturity of a company when making an assessment. This means that when rating the different criteria, the jury will also look at where the company is today and how much impact the implementation of the proposed project will have on the company. In the final evaluation, the jury will not only rate the project itself, but also look at the evolution and learning curve that the participants have shown throughout the challenge. The following paragraphs describe which criteria will be considered for the assessment of the projects. The criteria will be weighted as follows:

	Admission to challenge	Final evaluation
Circularity	20%	20%
Impact	20%	15%
Novelty/Innovation	20%	15%
Value creation	20%	15%
Scalability	20%	15%
Evolution of project	N/A	20%

Circularity

This criterion is a knock-out criterion. The proposed solution will have to fulfill one or several requirements of what classifies a project as being circular as defined in here:

Circular Economy: All economic activity that is substantially contributing to the protection of the environment and that meets at least one of the following:

- a) making more efficient use of natural resources, including sustainably sourced bio-based materials (e.g., new biopolymers, new fibers, etc.) and other raw materials in production, including reducing the use of primary raw materials or increasing the use of secondary raw materials.
- b) prolonging the use and reuse of products, including through increasing the durability, reparability, upgradeability or reusability of products as well as through reuse, design for longevity, reorientation, reconditioning, upgrading, repair and sharing and through appropriate services and business models.
- c) increasing the recyclability of products, including that of the individual materials contained in products, inter alia through disassembly and substitution or reduced use of products and materials that are not recyclable, in particular in design and manufacturing activities and through appropriate services and business models.
- d) Substantially reducing the content of substances of very high concern and substituting them in materials and products throughout their life cycle, including by replacing them with safe alternatives and ensuring traceability;
- e) Avoiding the generation of waste*

*For information, the table below shows how the different solutions to avoid waste are categorised in the [Zero-Waste Strategy Luxembourg](#):

1	Design products to preserve resources, manage soils, avoid overproduction/pollution	PRODUCT (DESIGN, PRODUCTION, USE)
2A	Better 1 st use of products: using instead of owning, sharing, repairing, avoid wastage	
2B	Better n th use: reuse product (e.g. reselling, donation, etc.)	
3A	Re-utilisation of products/components, repair and recondition, use in cascades	REUSABLE RESOURCES, COMPONENTS
3B	Valorisation of resources: recycling	
N/A	Energetic valorisation	WASTE (ULTIMATE LOSS FOR CIRCULAR ECONOMY)
N/A	Elimination	

Impact

- How large is the waste fraction that you reduce?
- Will the product create impact in terms of shifting away from existing solutions that reduce waste, etc.
- How big is the CO₂-reduction of your solution compared to a conventional and or to the company's current approach?

Novelty and innovation level of the idea

- Is the idea revolutionary and does it bring new solutions to an existing problem?
- What is the visionary aim of the solution?

- How does the solution differ from other solutions on the market?

Value creation

- What value do you create for the user, the environment and society as a whole?
- Who are the primary customers and users?
- What is the target market for the solution?
- What is the business model for the solution, and what makes it circular?
- What social, economic and environmental gains does the solution achieve?

Scalability

- Does the solution have market potential?
- How big a market does the new solution appeal to?
- What does it take for the solution to reach the market and scale?
- How can new technologies help speed up the production or scale the solution?

Project Evolution (Final evaluation only)

- How much did the project evolve throughout the challenge?
- Was the team open to comments and willing to implement changes accordingly?
- Did the team consider the feedback from the Steering Committee?
- Did the team collaborate with the coaches in order to improve their project?
- Is the team motivated to continue working on the project after the end of the programme?

Contact

Marc Lis
Cluster Manager Creative Industries
T: (+352) 43 62 63-681
marc.lis@luxinnovation.lu

Anja Höthker
Project Manager Flagship Projects
T: (+352) 43 62 63-854
anja.hoethker@luxinnovation.lu